



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR- 50468

Date: 28/02/2025

Title: "Gold Standard Diagnostic Analysis and Management of Shwasa Roga in Different Pathological Conditions"

Recommendation:

- ✓ Accept as it is
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		✓		
Techn. Quality		✓		
Clarity		✓		
Significance		✓		

Reviewer Name: Dr. S. K. Nath

Date: 02/03/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication:

This research provides a systematic analysis of Shwasa Roga, categorizing its causes and Ayurvedic treatment approaches. The study successfully highlights cost-effective, natural treatment options for respiratory disorders, reinforcing the importance of holistic disease management in Ayurveda.

However, further clinical validation, safety studies, and comparative research with modern medicine are required to enhance the practical application of Ayurvedic formulations in managing chronic respiratory diseases. Future studies should incorporate patient-based clinical trials, dosage standardization, and toxicity assessments to establish Ayurvedic treatments as scientifically validated alternatives for respiratory care.

This paper is a valuable resource for Ayurvedic practitioners, offering a structured approach to diagnosing and managing Shwasa Roga. With further empirical research, the findings could contribute to the integration of Ayurveda into mainstream respiratory healthcare, making treatments more accessible and scientifically robust.

Reviewer's Comment / Report

This research paper explores the diagnosis and management of Shwasa Roga (respiratory disorders) in Ayurveda, considering its various etiological factors and treatment approaches. With the increasing global burden of respiratory diseases like asthma and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD), the study emphasizes the need for cost-effective and accessible Ayurvedic treatments.

The paper reviews causative factors of Shwasa Roga based on Ayurvedic texts, including Charaka Samhita and Bhaishajya Ratnavali, and categorizes them into respiratory and extra-respiratory causes. It presents specific Ayurvedic formulations for each category, analyzing their therapeutic potential in treating conditions such as bronchitis, pneumonia, pleurisy, and metabolic disorders linked to respiratory distress. The study suggests mono-therapy (single formulation) or bi-therapy (dual formulation) approaches for effective disease management.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

Key Strengths of the Study

- 1. Comprehensive Ayurvedic Perspective on Respiratory Disorders:** The paper provides a detailed analysis of Shwasa Roga, categorizing its direct and indirect causes based on classical Ayurvedic texts. It effectively links diet, lifestyle, and environmental factors to respiratory disease development.
- 2. Extensive Compilation of Ayurvedic Treatments:** The study lists specific Ayurvedic formulations for respiratory and systemic causes of Shwasa Roga, including:
 - Herbal remedies (Haridrakhand, Sitopladi Churna, Vasa Avaleha)
 - Rasa-based preparations (Sameerpannag Rasa, Nagarjun Abhra Rasa)
 - Gut and metabolic treatments (Shankha Vati, Hingwadi Churna, Punarnavadi Kwath)
 - This categorization provides practitioners with a structured approach to choosing treatments based on the etiology of respiratory illness.
- 3. Scientific Integration with Classical Texts:** The research is well-referenced, citing sources from Charaka Samhita, Bhaishajya Ratnavali, and modern Ayurvedic studies. The study validates traditional treatments through a scientific, symptom-based approach, making it useful for contemporary Ayurvedic practitioners.
- 4. Discussion of Systemic Disorders Affecting Respiratory Health:** The study goes beyond respiratory causes and explores extra-respiratory factors, such as gastrointestinal disorders (Ama, Udavarta), cardiac conditions (Hridroga, Rakta Gata Vata), and metabolic disorders (diabetes, obesity, anemia). This holistic approach aligns with Ayurveda's principle of treating the root cause rather than just symptoms.

Limitations of the Study

- 1. Lack of Experimental or Clinical Data:** While the study is based on literature reviews, it lacks clinical trials or patient case studies to validate the effectiveness of the suggested treatments. Future research should include empirical data and patient outcomes to confirm the therapeutic efficacy of the listed formulations.
- 2. Limited Discussion on Dosage and Safety:** The study does not specify dosage guidelines, contraindications, or potential side effects of the recommended formulations. Toxicity studies and safety evaluations should be conducted, particularly for rasa-based (metallic/mineral) formulations.
- 3. Absence of Comparative Analysis with Modern Medicine:** The paper does not compare Ayurvedic treatments with allopathic respiratory therapies, such as bronchodilators, corticosteroids, or oxygen therapy. A comparative effectiveness study could help bridge traditional and modern medical practices.