



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No.: IJAR-50410

Date: 26-02-2025

Title: From "Dunki to Dhaka" - Dual Analysis of Inter and Intra migration in South Asia.

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is.....**YES**.....
- Accept after minor revision.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality	√			
Techn. Quality		√		
Clarity		√		
Significance			√	

Reviewer's Name: Dr Abdul Hameed Shah

Reviewer's Decision about Paper: **Recommended for Publication.**

Comments (*Use additional pages, if required*)

Reviewer's Comment / Report

The paper, "Dunki to Dhaka: Dual Analysis of Inter and Intra Migration in South Asia," provides a detailed examination of illegal migration in the South Asian region. By exploring both inter-regional and intra-regional migration, the study successfully highlights the factors driving individuals to seek opportunities abroad and within neighboring countries.

Strengths of the Paper

1. **Comprehensive Scope and Thematic Clarity:** The paper effectively distinguishes between inter and intra migration while maintaining a clear focus on illegal migration. The categorization of migration based on external opportunities versus regional socio-political factors enhances the study's analytical depth.
2. **Engagement with Empirical Data:** The study integrates statistics from international organizations such as the IOM and the UNHRC, which strengthens its credibility. The

REVIEWER'S REPORT

- inclusion of real-world data, such as the number of migrants from South Asia in North America and Europe, contextualizes the discussion within a broader global framework.
3. **Historical and Policy Context:** The paper provides historical context regarding the influx of illegal Bangladeshi migrants into India post-1971. It also outlines international and domestic policies affecting migration, including reports from the United Nations and Indian government officials on the economic and social impact of migration.
 4. **Insight into Migration Routes and Challenges:** The study discusses various illegal migration routes, such as the Balkan route, sea voyage, and the Dunky route. By detailing the perils faced by migrants—including human trafficking, violence, and exploitation—the paper presents a compelling narrative on the risks associated with illegal migration.
 5. **Use of Scholarly Literature:** The literature review engages with key scholarly works, including Rebecca Dowd's study on "stranded migration" and Shahid Javed Burki's research on the South Asian diaspora. The integration of different academic perspectives provides a well-rounded analysis of migration trends and their socio-economic implications.
 6. **Case Studies and Contemporary Examples:** The paper includes relevant case studies and real-world incidents, such as the deportation of 104 Indians from the U.S. and the viral image of Alan Kurdi, to humanize the discussion on migration challenges. These instances underscore the dangers and emotional toll of migration.

Conclusion

The paper offers an in-depth and structured analysis of illegal migration in South Asia by addressing both external and regional dynamics. Through empirical data, historical context, policy analysis, and case studies, the research provides a thorough examination of the motivations, risks, and socio-economic consequences of migration. The discussion effectively portrays migration as a consequence of economic disparity and lack of opportunities, reinforcing its significance as a subject of scholarly and policy interest.