



REVIEWER'S REPORT

Manuscript No. IJAR-50410

Date: 25/02/25

Title: From Dunki to Dhaka- Dual Analysis of Inter and Intra Migration in South Asia

Recommendation:

- Accept as it is
- Accept after minor revision.....Yes.....
- Accept after major revision
- Do not accept (*Reasons below*)

Rating	Excel.	Good	Fair	Poor
Originality		Yes		
Techn. Quality		Yes		
Clarity	Yes			
Significance	Yes			

Reviewer Name: Dr. Feroze Ahmad

Date:25/02/2025

Reviewer's Comment for Publication.

(To be published with the manuscript in the journal)

The reviewer is requested to provide a brief comment (3-4 lines) highlighting the significance, strengths, or key insights of the manuscript. This comment will be Displayed in the journal publication alongside with the reviewers name.

This paper provides an insightful dual analysis of illegal migration in South Asia, focusing on both inter-migration (outward migration to Western countries) and intra-migration (migration within South Asia). The study highlights the driving factors behind migration, such as economic disparity and regional conflict, and offers a detailed exploration of the dangers faced by migrants, particularly along the perilous "Dunki" route. The paper's emphasis on human rights and its contribution to understanding the socio-political implications of migration in South Asia make it a valuable addition to the discourse on migration studies.

Detailed Summary Review Report:

The research paper focuses on the dual analysis of illegal migration from and within South Asia, specifically discussing inter-migration (migration from South Asia to abroad) and intra-migration (migration within South Asia). The paper aims to delve into the causes and consequences of illegal migration in the South Asian context, particularly focusing on the "Dunki" route—a hazardous migration route to the United States. The author highlights the vulnerability of migrants driven by low living standards, economic disparity, and regional socio-political dynamics that force people to seek better lives elsewhere.

This paper provides a significant contribution to the existing body of research on illegal migration by focusing on the regional dynamics of South Asia. It emphasizes the complexities of both inter- and intra-regional migration, with particular focus on the dangers and hardships of the illegal migration journey.

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

The case of Bangladeshis migrating illegally into India since the 1971 war and the exploration of routes like "Dunki" provides a nuanced understanding of migration trends in South Asia, making it a timely and relevant study in the current global migration discourse.

Strengths:

- **Comprehensive Coverage of Migration Types:** The paper effectively distinguishes between inter-migration and intra-migration, addressing both external and regional migration challenges in South Asia.
- **Rich Literature Review:** The author incorporates a well-rounded review of the literature, citing scholarly work on migration patterns, risks, and socio-political implications. The references to UNHCR studies, reports on migrant rights, and works on the socio-political impacts of migration add depth to the analysis.
- **Focus on the Dunky Route:** The detailed examination of the Dunky route is one of the paper's key strengths, providing readers with an insight into one of the most dangerous illegal migration routes, thereby shedding light on the human cost of the pursuit of the "American Dream."
- **Highlighting Human Rights Issues:** The research emphasizes the human rights violations that undocumented migrants face, such as exploitation, trafficking, and violence, thus raising important ethical questions that demand attention from global policymakers.

Weaknesses:

- **Limited Empirical Data:** While the paper provides an extensive theoretical discussion and literature review, it would benefit from more empirical data or case studies, especially from migrant interviews or surveys that could illustrate the real-life impact of migration policies in South Asia.
- **Overemphasis on Western Migration Routes:** The primary focus on illegal migration to Western countries, particularly the U.S., might limit the scope of understanding intra-regional migration, which is just as crucial for addressing migration issues within South Asia itself.
- **Inadequate Exploration of Legal Migration:** The paper overlooks the issue of legal migration, which also plays a crucial role in shaping the migration patterns from South Asia. A comparative analysis of legal and illegal migration could provide a more holistic view of the migration landscape in the region.

Significance of the Findings:

The findings underscore the deep-rooted causes of migration in South Asia, namely economic disparity, lack of opportunities, and the pursuit of a better life. These factors create a situation where migration is viewed not as a choice, but as a desperate survival strategy. The paper also raises awareness of the dangers faced by migrants on illegal routes, stressing the role of human trafficking and the risks of exploitation. Furthermore, the paper highlights the often-overlooked consequences of intra-regional migration, especially the illegal influx of Bangladeshi migrants into India, which is a highly sensitive political issue.

Recommendations:

The study concludes that both inter- and intra-migration in South Asia are driven by similar underlying causes: economic hardship and a desire for a better life. However, the routes and challenges differ, with

International Journal of Advanced Research

Publisher's Name: Jana Publication and Research LLP

www.journalijar.com

REVIEWER'S REPORT

inter-migration being more driven by the aspiration for a "Western" lifestyle and the creation of an NRI identity, while intra-migration is shaped by regional issues such as ethnic and religious conflicts.

The author recommends better regional cooperation, legal frameworks, and support systems to manage migration within South Asia. Policies that address the root causes of migration—economic disparity, unemployment, and human rights violations—are essential to mitigating the pressures that lead to illegal migration.

The paper provides a strong theoretical foundation, but it would benefit from further empirical research, particularly regarding the socio-political challenges of intra-regional migration. The inclusion of quantitative data, interviews with migrants, or case studies could provide a richer, more nuanced understanding of the issues.

Nonetheless, the paper's thorough exploration of migration routes, socio-political dynamics, and human rights implications makes it a valuable contribution to the field. With minor revisions, it would be a suitable for publication.